

# LEGAL GOVERNANCE OF HEALTH CARE

Winter 2004

## VOLUME II

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### CHAPTER 7: TORT THEORY: CRITICAL PERSPECTIVES; WORKING WITHIN THE SYSTEM

<i>Rothwell v. Raes</i> (1988) 66 O.R. (2d) 449 (Ont. H.C.) .....	1
Picard, E. and Robertson, G., <i>Legal Liability of Doctors and Hospitals in Canada</i> (3 <sup>rd</sup> ed.) (Carswell: Toronto, 1996), pp. 423-427 .....	4
Canada, Commission of Inquiry on the Blood System in Canada, (Krever, J., Comm'r.), <i>Final Report</i> , Vol. 3, pp. 1029-1045 (Ottawa: 1997) .....	9
Trebilcock, M., "The Future of Tort Law: Mapping the Contours of the Debate" (1989) 15 Can. Bus. L.J., 471 .....	19
National Steering Committee on Patient Safety, "Building a Safer System: A National Integrated Strategy for Improving Patient Safety in Canadian Health Care" (Ottawa: Royal College of Physicians and Surgeons of Canada, 2000), available online at: <a href="http://rcpsc.medical.org/english/publications/building-a_safer-system_e.pdf">http://rcpsc.medical.org/english/publications/building-a_safer-system_e.pdf</a> .....	26
Watson, G., "An Overview of Ontario's Class Proceedings Legislation" Holmstead and Watson (Toronto: Thomson Publishing 2000) .....	52
Canadian Press, "Thousands Awarded Compensation in Hepatitis B Suit Against Ontario Doctor," (December 8, 2001) [See Webspurs, CBCA 2001 Search Engine] .....	59
Green, S., "Cheques on the Way in Hep B lawsuit", North York Mirror	

(Jan. 16, 2002), p. 11 .....	60
<i>Endean v. Can. Red Cross Society</i> , [1997] B.C.J. No. 2180 (BCSC) .....	61
Harper, T., "Lawyers paid before bad-blood victims", The Toronto Star (February 14, 2000) p. A1, 11 .....	66
Zuckerman, A., "Rationing Procedure rather than Access to Justice: (1995) 22 J. Law and Society 157 .....	68
Watson, G., and McGowan, M., "Simplified Procedure: Highlights of Rule 76", in <i>Ontario Civil Practice, 1997</i> .....	74

## **CHAPTER 8: SUBSTITUTE DECISION MAKING: MINORS**

### **I. LIFE-PRESERVING TREATMENT AND THE BEST INTERESTS OF THE CHILD**

Note .....	81
<i>B. (R.) v. Children's Aid Society of Metropolitan Toronto</i> [1995] 1 S.C.R. 315 .....	82
<i>Sup't of Family and Child Services v. R. D. and S.D.</i> (1983) 42 B.C.L.R. 173 (S.C.), rev'g (1983) 42 B.C.L.R. 153 (Prov. Ct.) .....	98
<i>Saskatchewan (Minister of Social Services) v. P.</i> (1990) 69 D.L.R. (4th) 134 (Sask. Prov. Ct.) .....	109
<i>A (Children), Re [Siamese Twins Decision]</i> [2000] E.W.J. No. 4875 (C.A.) .....	116
<i>A.M. v. Benes</i> (1999), 46 O.R. (3d) 271 (C.A.) .....	118

### **II. MATURE MINORS**

<i>J.S.C. and C.H.C. v. Wren</i> [1978] 2 W.R. 669 (Alta. C.A.) .....	122
<i>Re A. Y.</i> (1993) 111 Nfld. and P.E.I.R. 91 and 348 A.P.R. Nfld. S.C.) .....	125

Note .....	130
Gilmour, J., “Children, Adolescents and Health Care”, in Downie, J., Caulfield, T. and Flood, C. (eds.), <i>Canadian Health Law and Policy</i> (2d ed.) (Toronto: Butterworths, 2002) (extracts) .....	131

## CHAPTER 9: PUBLIC HOSPITALS

### I. GOVERNANCE

“Hospitals: Provincial and Territorial Legislation”, <i>Canadian Health Facilities Law Guide</i> (North York: CCH Canadian Ltd., 1996 - 1997), pp. 512-520 (extracts) .....	136
---	-----

### II. LIABILITY

Picard, E. and Robertson, G., <i>Legal Liability of Doctors and Hospitals in Canada</i> (3rd ed.) (Scarborough: Carswell, 1996), 363-367, 381-386, 392-397 (extracts) .....	142
---	-----

Note .....	146
------------	-----

<i>Yepremian v. Scarborough General Hospital</i> (1978) 20 O.R. (2d) 510 (H.C.) .....	147
---	-----

<i>Yepremian v. Scarborough General Hospital</i> (1980) 28 O.R. (2d) 494 (C.A.) .....	153
---	-----

<i>Kielley v. General Hospital</i> , [1997] N.J. No. 123 (C.A.), rev'd. on damages, [1999] N.J. No. 355 (C.A.) .....	167
--	-----

<i>Weiss c. Solomon</i> (1989) 48 C.C.L.T. 280 (Que. S.C.) .....	172
--	-----

### III. PRIVILEGES

Martin, D.H., “Hospital Privileges and the Law”, in Dickens, B. and Ouellette, M. (eds.), <i>Health Care, Ethics and Law</i> (Montreal: Les Editions, Themis, 1993), pp. 316-322 (extracts) .....	174
---	-----

<i>Shepherd v. Colchester Regional Hospital Commission</i> (1995) 29 Admin. L.R. 41 (N.S.C.A.) .....	178
--	-----

Note .....	186
------------	-----

<i>Cameron v. East Prince Health Authority</i> , [1999] PEI. J. No. 44 (PEISC) .....	187
--	-----

## CHAPTER 10: HEALTH INSURANCE

<i>Health Insurance Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. H. 6 (extracts) .....	208
<i>Health Insurance Regulations</i> , General, O.Reg. 552/90, amended to O. Reg. 422/01 (extracts) .....	216
<i>Shulman v. College of Audiologists</i> (2001) O. J. No 5057 (Div. Ct.) .....	217
Abraham, C., “Fiona’s Choice: lose breast or risk life”, <i>Globe and Mail</i> (17 July 1998) A1, A8 .....	224
<i>Fiona Hart v. The General Manager, the Ontario Health Insurance Plan</i> , [1999] File No. S6136 (Health Services Appeal and Review Board) .....	229
<i>D.R. and L.R. v. The General Manager of the Ontario Health Insurance Plan</i> , [1999] File No. 5472, 5491, 5932, 5937, 5948 (Health Services Appeal Board) .....	231
<i>Stein v. Quebec (Regie de l’Assurance-maladie)</i> , [1999] R.J.Q. 2416 (Sup. Ct.) .....	240
<i>Kramer v. General Manager, OHIP (Health Services Appeal Board)</i> , File No. S. 6310, 2001 .....	252
<i>Smith v. General Manager, OHIP (Health Services Appeal Board)</i> , 2001 File No. 01-HIA-0067 .....	258
Jackman, M., “The Implications of Section 7 of the <i>Charter</i> for Health Care Spending in Canada”, Discussion Paper No. 31 prepared for the Commission on the Future of Health Care in Canada (October, 2002) (extracts) .....	261
Hartt, S., Monahan, P., “The Charter and Health Care: Guaranteeing Timely Access to Health Care for Canadians”, C.D. Howe Institute Commentary (May 2002); available online at: <a href="http://www.cdhowe.org">www.cdhowe.org</a> . (extracts) .....	268
Note .....	272

## CHAPTER 11: INDEPENDENT HEALTH FACILITIES ACT

Sharpe, G., "Introduction: The Independent Health Facilities Act", (1991) 12: 2 Health Law in Canada 39 .....	273
MacMillan, R., Barnes, M., "The Independent Health Facilities Act: A First for North America", (1991) 11:3 Health Law in Canada 59 .....	274
Ontario Ministry of Health, <i>Independent Health Facilities Act</i> Fact Sheet (undated) .....	281
Ontario Ministry of Health " <i>Independent Health Facilities Act</i> Report of Activities, April 1900-December 1991" .....	287
Ministry of Health, News Release, "Ontario Women Get Greater Choice in Childbirth", March 4, 1994 .....	290
Notice of Proposal to Issue a Licence to Toronto Birth Centre Inc. under the <i>Independent Health Facilities Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. I.3 .....	292
Toronto Birth Centre Inc., "The Ontario Freestanding Birth Centre Project: A model health care initiative", presented to the Office of the Ministry of Health, September 13, 1995 .....	296
Notice of Refusal to Issue Any Licence in Respect of Request for Proposals Number 92-030 under the <i>Independent Health Facilities Act</i> , September 28, 1995 .....	298
-----, "Decision not to licence birth centre appealed" <i>Globe and Mail</i> , June 8, 1996 .....	302
Claridge, T., "Court refuses to interfere in decision" <i>Globe and Mail</i> , June 8, 1996 .....	303
<i>Ottawa-Carleton Dialysis Services v. Ontario (Ministry of Health)</i> [1996] O.J. No. 2721 (Ont. Ct. (Gen. Div.)) (QL) .....	304

Ontario, Legislative Assembly, Standing Committee on  
 General Government, “*Saving and Restructuring Act, 1995*”,  
 Submission of the Toronto Birth Centre Inc. (Dec. 22, 1995) ..... 321

Post Script: Correspondence between the Toronto Birth  
 Centre Inc. and the Health Services Restructuring Commission,  
 October 21, 1997 and December 3, 1997 ..... 324

Gilmour, Joan M., “Creeping Privatization in Health Care:  
 Implications for Women as the State Redraws its Role” in:  
 B. Cossman & J. Fudge (eds.), *Privatization, Law and the  
 Challenge to Feminism* (Toronto: U. Toronto Press, 2002) ..... 327

*Government Efficiency Act*, S.O. 2002, c. 18, Sch. I (backgrounder) ..... 330

Gilmour, Joan M., “Regulating Free-Standing Health Facilities:  
 An Entrée for Privatization and For-Profit Delivery in Health Care”  
 (2003) *Health L.J.* (Special Edition) 131-152. (extracts)..... 331

**CHAPTER 12: HEALTH RECORDS: CONFIDENTIALITY, ACCESS,  
 DISCLOSURE**

Rozovsky, L. and Rozovsky, F., “The Purpose  
 of Health Records”, in *Canadian Health Information*,  
 (Toronto: Butterworths, 1992) at 5- 14 ..... 335

*McInerney v. MacDonald* (1992) 93 D.L.R. (4th) 415 (S.C.C.)..... 340

*R. v. Mills* [1999] 3 S.C.R. 668 ..... 349

*R. v. Serendip Physiotherapy Clinic* [2003] O.J. No. 2407 (Sup. Ct.) ..... 360

Miller, J., “Physician-Patient Confidentiality and Familial  
 Access to Genetic Information”, (1994) 2 *Health Law J.* 141 ..... 366

Picard, E. and Robertson, G., *Legal Liability of Doctors and  
 Hospitals in Canada* (3rd) (Toronto; Carswell, 1996) at 154-155 ..... 376

Institute for Clinical Evaluative Sciences in Ontario, “News Release”, Oct. 29, 1997 .....	377
Maclean, J., “College Council Adopts New Standard for Duty to Inform”, Members’ Dialogue (Nov./Dec. 1998), pp. 26-27 .....	378
<i>Smith v. Jones</i> , [1999] 1 S.C.R. 455 .....	380
Marshall, M., von Tigerstrom, B., “Health Information”, in Downie, J., Caulfield, T., Flood, C., (2d ed.), <i>Canadian Health Law and Policy</i> (Toronto: Butterworths, 2002), 165-173; 181-182 .....	394
College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, “Protecting patients personal information” (Members Dialogue, Nov./Dec. 2003).....	405

### **CHAPTER 13: HEALTH SERVICES, DISCRIMINATION AND DISABILITY**

<i>Ontario Human Rights Code</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c.H.19 (extracts) .....	409
<i>Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms</i> , ss. 1, 7, 12, 15 .....	414
<i>E. (Mrs.) v. Eve</i> [1986] 2 S.C.R. 388 .....	415
<i>Eaton v. Brant County Board of Education</i> [1997] 1 S.C.R. 241 .....	417
<i>Quesnel v. Ontario (Human Rights Commission)</i> (1995) (Bd. of Inq.) .....	420
<i>Eldridge v. British Columbia (Attorney General)</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 624 .....	424
<i>Law v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)</i> , [1999] 1 S.C.R. 497 (extracts) .....	452
<i>Granovsky v. Canada (Minister of Employment and Immigration)</i> , [2001] 1 S.C.R. 703 (extracts) .....	457
<i>Auton (Guardian ad litem of) v. British Columbia (Attorney General)</i> [2002] B.C.J. No. 2258 (BCCA), leave to appeal	

granted, [2002] S.C.C.A. No. 510 .....	461
Abbate, G., "Ontario woman sues over son's care," Globe and Mail (24 January 2002) A4 .....	476

These materials were prepared with the research assistance of Alexandra Wilbee, Brad Moscato, Brena Parnes, Barbara Watson, Theodora Theodonis, Faith Holder, and Wendy Sutton, and the secretarial assistance of Felicia Holder