

HEALTH LAW

VOLUME II

FALL 2003

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VII. THE MATERNAL/FETAL RELATIONSHIP

Rodgers, S., "Pregnancy as Justification for Loss of Judicial Autonomy" in Overall, C., ed., <i>The Future of Human Reproduction</i> (Toronto: Women's Press, 1989) 174.	1
<i>Re A. (in utero)</i> (1990), 75 O.R. (2d) 82 (U.F.C.).	6
Canadian Press, "Mother, Son Die in Birth Crisis" <i>Weekend Sun</i> (25 February 1995) A11.	13
<i>Winnipeg Child and Family Services v. G.</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 925.	14
"Stress Linked to Miscarriages" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (5 June 1997) A16.	30
Swift, D., "Prenatal Surgery Increasingly More Common" <i>The Medical Post</i> (3 June 1997) 30.	31
<i>Dobson v. Dobson</i> , [1999] 2 S.C.R. 753.	32
Hartouni, V., "Containing Women: Reproductive Discourse in the 1980s" in Penley, L., & Ross, A., eds., <i>Technoculture</i> (Minneapolis: U. Minn. Press, 1991) 27-55 (extracts).	50

VIII. LEGAL AND POLICY DIMENSIONS OF NEW REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES

Library of Parliament, <i>Bill C-13: Assisted Human Reproduction Act</i> (Legislative Summary) by M. Hebert <i>et al.</i> (Ottawa: Library of Parliament, 2003), online: Parliament of Canada < http://www.parl.gc.ca/37/2/parlbus/chambus/house/bills/summaries/c13-e.pdf > (last modified: 16 April 2003).	58
Bill C-13: <i>An Act respecting assisted human reproduction and related research</i> , 2d Sess., 37th Parl., 2002 (extracts).	79

Sherwin, S., “New Reproductive Technologies” in <i>No Longer Patient: Feminist Ethics and Health Care</i> (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992) 132-136 (extracts).	97
Weiss, R., “Septuplets Spark a Fertility Debate” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (8 December 1997) D7.	100
Kalman, M., “Widow, 58, Carrying Test-Tube Baby” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (13 June 1998) A21.	103
Gibson, N., “Police Probe ‘Grandma Mum’ and Brother” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (22 June 2001) A14.	104
Weiss, R., “Fertility Process Creates Legally Parentless Baby” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (22 March 1998).	105
Lippman, A., “Never Too Late: Biotechnology, Women, and Reproduction” (1995) 40 McGill L.J. 875.	106
Nisker, J., “The Use of IVF Patients as Oocyte “Donors”” <i>Policy Options</i> (March 1996) 18-21.	113
Cooper Centre for IVF Donor Oocyte Program	118
Cheney, P., “Human Egg Trade Lures Elite Students” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (9 July 1998) A1.	121

IX. GENETIC TESTING

(i) INTRODUCTION

Elias, M.D., & Annas, G., <i>Reproductive Genetics and the Law</i> (Chicago: Year Book Publishers, 1987) at 53-55, 76-82.	123
Privacy Commissioner of Canada, “Genetic Testing and Privacy” (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1992) at 35-41.	128

(ii) PRE-NATAL SCREENING

Knoppers, B.M., “Human Genetics: Parental, Professional and Political Responsibility” (1993) 1 Health L.J. 14.	134
Lippman, A., “Worrying – And Worrying About – The Geneticization	

of Reproduction and Health” in Basen, G., <i>et al.</i> , eds., <i>Misconceptions</i> (Hull, Qc.: Voyageur Publishing, 1993) 39-53.	141
Silvers, A., “On Not Iterating Women’s Disability: A Crossover Perspective on Genetic Dilemmas” in Donchin, A., & Purdy, L.M., eds., <i>Embodying Bioethics: Recent Feminist Advances</i> (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1999) 177-199 (extracts).	148
Mitchell, A., “Profile: Gauvin McCullough: Genetic Engineering Is Getting Out of Hand” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (13 April 2002).	154
(iii) POST-NATAL TESTING	
Lippman, A., “Worrying – And Worrying About – The Geneticization of Reproduction and Health” in Basen, G., <i>et al.</i> , eds., <i>Misconceptions</i> (Hull, Qc.: Voyageur Publishing, 1993) 53-60.	157
Billings, P.R., <i>et al.</i> , “Discrimination as a Consequence of Genetic Testing” (1992) 50 Am. J. Hum. Gen. 476-482.	161
Draper, E., <i>Risky Business: Genetic Testing and Exclusionary Practices in the Hazardous Workplace</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), ch. 1 (extracts).	167
Kolata, G., “Gene’s Link to Heart and Brain Poses Dilemma” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (31 October 1995) A16.	174
“Who’ll Develop Huntington’s? That Is Big Question” <i>The Medical Post</i> (18 March 1997) 39.	176
Wolf, S.M., “Beyond ‘Genetic Discrimination’: Toward the Broader Harm of Geneticism” (1995) 23 J. L., Med. & Ethics 345.	177
X. "OUR" BODIES? PROPERTY RIGHTS IN HUMAN TISSUE	
<i>Trillium Gift of Life Network Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. H.20 (extracts).	185
Note	192
Priest, L., “Transplant Patients Wait Years — Or They Can Pay This Man” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (1 June 2001) A1 & A6.	193
Priest, L., “Boss Gets Organ From Domestic” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (16 November 2002).	199

Scott, R., <i>The Body as Property</i> (New York: Viking Press, 1981) at 184-186.	202
U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, <i>New Developments in Biotechnology: Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells - Special Report</i> , OTA-BA-337 (Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1987) (extracts).	204
<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i> , 51 Cal. 3d 120, 271 Cal Rptr. 146 (Cal. S.C. 1990).	220
Note.....	233
Karpen, M., “Tissue Engineering Gears up for ‘Bionic’ Future” <i>The Medical Post</i> (1 April 1997) 39.	234
Kreidié, A., “Infant Foreskin Cells Help Heal Chronic Wounds” <i>The Medical Post</i> (16 December 1997) 46.	237
“Medical” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (11 April 1997) B6.	238
Gilmour, J., “‘Our’ Bodies? Property Rights in Human Tissue” (1993) 8 <i>Can. J. L. & Society</i> 113.	239
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Procurement and Transfer of Human Tissues and Organs</i> (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1992).	243
Note.....	247
Royal Commission on New Reproductive Technologies, <i>Proceed With Care</i> (Final Report), vol. 2 (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1993) at 981-983.	248
American Fertility Society Update, “Fetal Tissue May Be New Oocyte Supply” <i>The Medical Post</i> (29 November 1994) 24.	253
“Male Fetus Eyed as Source for Ovarian Cancer Therapy” <i>The Medical Post</i> (28 October 1997).	254
“Birth of Donor Brother Questioned” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (4 October 2000) A3.	255
Note	256
“Ebay Stops Kidney Auctions” <i>USA TODAY</i> (3 September 1999).	257

XI. DRUGS AND DEVICES: LIABILITY AND REGULATION

(i) **LIABILITY; REGULATION; INFORMED CONSENT**

Note..... 259

Health Protection Branch, Health and Welfare Canada,
Health Protection and Drug Laws (Ottawa: Canada
Communications Group, 1991) at 7, 25-29. 260

Lexchin, J., “Government Control and Regulation of Reproductive
Drugs and Devices” (distributed by NAWL and DES Action). 264

Altman, L.K., “Fatal Drug Trial Raises Questions About ‘Informed Consent’”
New York Times (5 October 1993) B7. 270

Note 274

Miller, M., “Phase I Cancer Trials: A Collusion of Misunderstanding”
(2000) 30:4 *Hastings Center Report* 34. 275

(ii) **TOO MUCH TOO SOON? BREAST IMPLANTS AND DES**

Hollis v. Dow Corning Corp., [1995] 4 S.C.R. 634. 282

Note 291

Acheson & Company Dow Corning Breast Implant Class Action, online:
<<http://www.achesonco.com/biclass.htm>> (date accessed: 18 June 2001). 292

Note 295

Papp, L., “Breast Implant Deal for 3,000”
The Toronto Star (6 February 1998) A1. 296

Kolata, G., “Why, to Science, the Law's an Ass”
The Globe and Mail (17 May 1995) A10. 298

“Implants a Textbook Case on How Public Can Rule Policy”
The Medical Post (11 March 1997) 6. 299

“Implants Faulty, Jury Rules” *The Globe and Mail* (19 August 1997) A16. 299

(iii) **TOO LITTLE TOO LATE? AIDS PATIENTS AND ACCESS TO EXPERIMENTAL DRUGS**

Dixon, J., “Catastrophic Rights: Vital Public Interests and Civil Liberties in Conflict”
in *Perspectives on AIDS* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1991) 122-136. 300

Treicher, P.A., “How to Have Theory in an Epidemic: The Evolution of AIDS Treatment Activism” in Penley, C., & Ross, A., eds., <i>Technoculture</i> (Minneapolis: U. Minn. Press, 1991) at 69-70, 76-78, 91-93.	312
Annas, G.J., “Faith (Healing), Hope, and Charity at the FDA: The Politics of AIDS Drug Trials”, in Gostin, L.O., ed., <i>AIDS and the Health Care System</i> (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990) 183-194.	315
Krueger, G., “AIDS Research Creates Ethical Issues” <i>The Medical Post</i> (5 July 1994) 64.	324
“Canada Criticized for Slow Approvals” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (2 July 1998) A9.	325

XII. AIDS and HIV

(i) DISCRIMINATION

Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Part I of the <i>Constitution Act, 1982</i> , being Schedule B to the <i>Canada Act 1982</i> (U.K.), 1982, c. 11, ss. 1, 7, 8, 9, 12, 15.	326
<i>Ontario Human Rights Code</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. H.19 (extracts).	327
Ontario Human Rights Commission, <i>Policy on HIV/AIDS-Related Discrimination</i> (27 November 1996) (extracts).	334
Note re <i>Thwaites v. Canada (Canadian Armed Forces)</i>	339

(a) Health Care Workers

Canadian Medical Association, “HIV Infection in the Workplace” CMA Policy 2000, online: < http://www.cma.ca/staticContent/HTML/No/12/where_we_stand/hiv_in_the_workplace.pdf > (last modified: 10 October 2002).	341
Fein, E., “Medical Workers with HIV Keep Silent, Fearing Reprisals” <i>New York Times</i> (21 December 1997) 41.	343
College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, “Summary of Recommendations Directed at Regulatory Bodies from the Consensus Conference on Infected Health Care Workers: Risk for Transmission of Blood Borne Pathogens” <i>Members’ Dialogue</i> (May/June 1998) 15.	346
Note	347

(b) Immigration

“An Ethical Analysis of the Mandatory Exclusion of Immigrants Who Test HIV-Positive”(2000) 5:4 Can. HIV/AIDS Pol’y & L. Rev. 348

Immigration and Refugee Protection Act, S.C. 2001, c. 27 (extracts). 350

Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration (4 May 2001). 352

Fitz-James, M., “Rules Create Lower Threshold for ‘Excessive Demand’” *Law Times* (11 November 2002) 11. 359

(c) Women

Overall, C., “AIDS and Women: The (Hetero)sexual Politics of HIV Infection” in Overall, C., & Zion, W., eds., *Perspectives on AIDS: Ethical and Social Issues* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1991) 27-38 (extracts). 361

(ii) USE OF CRIMINAL SANCTIONS

Note re *R. v. Thornton* (1991), 1 O.R. (3d) 480 (C.A.), aff’d [1993] 2 S.C.R. 445. 367

R. v. Cuerrier, [1998] 2 S.C.R. 371. 368

Elliott, R., “After *Cuerrier*: Canadian Criminal Law and the Non-Disclosure of HIV-Positive Status” (Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, 1999) (extracts). 383

Christie, T., “HIV Serostatus Disclosure: Legal, Scientific and Ethical Considerations” (2002) 22:3 Health L. Can. 70 (extracts). 389

Ainslie, D.C., “Questioning Bioethics: AIDS, Sexual Ethics, and the Duty to Warn” (1999) 29:5 Hastings Center Report 26 (extracts). 393

These materials were prepared with the assistance of Alexandra Wilbee, Simon Thang, Brena Parnes, and Faith Holder (research),

and Felicia Holder (secretarial).