

# HEALTH LAW

## VOLUME II

FALL 2003

### TABLE OF CONTENTS

#### VII. THE MATERNAL/FETAL RELATIONSHIP

Rodgers, S., "Pregnancy as Justification for Loss of Judicial Autonomy" in Overall, C., ed., <i>The Future of Human Reproduction</i> (Toronto: Women's Press, 1989) 174. ....	1
<i>Re A. (in utero)</i> (1990), 75 O.R. (2d) 82 (U.F.C.). ....	6
Canadian Press, "Mother, Son Die in Birth Crisis" <i>Weekend Sun</i> (25 February 1995) A11. ....	13
<i>Winnipeg Child and Family Services v. G.</i> , [1997] 3 S.C.R. 925. ....	14
"Stress Linked to Miscarriages" <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (5 June 1997) A16. ....	30
Swift, D., "Prenatal Surgery Increasingly More Common" <i>The Medical Post</i> (3 June 1997) 30. ....	31
<i>Dobson v. Dobson</i> , [1999] 2 S.C.R. 753. ....	32
Hartouni, V., "Containing Women: Reproductive Discourse in the 1980s" in Penley, L., & Ross, A., eds., <i>Technoculture</i> (Minneapolis: U. Minn. Press, 1991) 27-55 (extracts). ....	50

#### VIII. LEGAL AND POLICY DIMENSIONS OF NEW REPRODUCTIVE TECHNOLOGIES

Library of Parliament, <i>Bill C-13: Assisted Human Reproduction Act</i> (Legislative Summary) by M. Hebert <i>et al.</i> (Ottawa: Library of Parliament, 2003), online: Parliament of Canada < <a href="http://www.parl.gc.ca/37/2/parlbus/chambus/house/bills/summaries/c13-e.pdf">http://www.parl.gc.ca/37/2/parlbus/chambus/house/bills/summaries/c13-e.pdf</a> > (last modified: 16 April 2003). ....	58
Bill C-13: <i>An Act respecting assisted human reproduction and related research</i> , 2d Sess., 37th Parl., 2002 (extracts). ....	79

Sherwin, S., “New Reproductive Technologies” in <i>No Longer Patient: Feminist Ethics and Health Care</i> (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1992) 132-136 (extracts). .....	97
Weiss, R., “Septuplets Spark a Fertility Debate” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (8 December 1997) D7. ....	100
Kalman, M., “Widow, 58, Carrying Test-Tube Baby” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (13 June 1998) A21. ....	103
Gibson, N., “Police Probe ‘Grandma Mum’ and Brother” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (22 June 2001) A14. ....	104
Weiss, R., “Fertility Process Creates Legally Parentless Baby” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (22 March 1998). ....	105
Lippman, A., “Never Too Late: Biotechnology, Women, and Reproduction” (1995) 40 McGill L.J. 875. ....	106
Nisker, J., “The Use of IVF Patients as Oocyte “Donors”” <i>Policy Options</i> (March 1996) 18-21. ....	113
Cooper Centre for IVF Donor Oocyte Program .....	118
Cheney, P., “Human Egg Trade Lures Elite Students” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (9 July 1998) A1. ....	121

## **IX. GENETIC TESTING**

### **(i) INTRODUCTION**

Elias, M.D., & Annas, G., <i>Reproductive Genetics and the Law</i> (Chicago: Year Book Publishers, 1987) at 53-55, 76-82. ....	123
Privacy Commissioner of Canada, “Genetic Testing and Privacy” (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1992) at 35-41. ....	128

### **(ii) PRE-NATAL SCREENING**

Knoppers, B.M., “Human Genetics: Parental, Professional and Political Responsibility” (1993) 1 Health L.J. 14. ....	134
Lippman, A., “Worrying – And Worrying About – The Geneticization	

	of Reproduction and Health” in Basen, G., <i>et al.</i> , eds., <i>Misconceptions</i> (Hull, Qc.: Voyageur Publishing, 1993) 39-53. ....	141
	Silvers, A., “On Not Iterating Women’s Disability: A Crossover Perspective on Genetic Dilemmas” in Donchin, A., & Purdy, L.M., eds., <i>Embodying Bioethics: Recent Feminist Advances</i> (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield Publishers, 1999) 177-199 (extracts). ....	148
	Mitchell, A., “Profile: Gauvin McCullough: Genetic Engineering Is Getting Out of Hand” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (13 April 2002). ....	154
<b>(iii)</b>	<b><u>POST-NATAL TESTING</u></b>	
	Lippman, A., “Worrying – And Worrying About – The Geneticization of Reproduction and Health” in Basen, G., <i>et al.</i> , eds., <i>Misconceptions</i> (Hull, Qc.: Voyageur Publishing, 1993) 53-60. ....	157
	Billings, P.R., <i>et al.</i> , “Discrimination as a Consequence of Genetic Testing” (1992) 50 Am. J. Hum. Gen. 476-482. ....	161
	Draper, E., <i>Risky Business: Genetic Testing and Exclusionary Practices in the Hazardous Workplace</i> (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), ch. 1 (extracts). ....	167
	Kolata, G., “Gene’s Link to Heart and Brain Poses Dilemma” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (31 October 1995) A16. ....	174
	“Who’ll Develop Huntington’s? That Is Big Question” <i>The Medical Post</i> (18 March 1997) 39. ....	176
	Wolf, S.M., “Beyond ‘Genetic Discrimination’: Toward the Broader Harm of Geneticism” (1995) 23 J. L., Med. & Ethics 345. ....	177
<b>X.</b>	<b>"OUR" BODIES? PROPERTY RIGHTS IN HUMAN TISSUE</b>	
	<i>Trillium Gift of Life Network Act</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. H.20 (extracts). ....	185
	Note .....	192
	Priest, L., “Transplant Patients Wait Years — Or They Can Pay This Man” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (1 June 2001) A1 & A6. ....	193
	Priest, L., “Boss Gets Organ From Domestic” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (16 November 2002). ....	199

Scott, R., <i>The Body as Property</i> (New York: Viking Press, 1981) at 184-186. ....	202
U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, <i>New Developments in Biotechnology: Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells - Special Report</i> , OTA-BA-337 (Washington, D.C.: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1987) (extracts). ....	204
<i>Moore v. Regents of the University of California</i> , 51 Cal. 3d 120, 271 Cal Rptr. 146 (Cal. S.C. 1990). ....	220
Note.....	233
Karpen, M., “Tissue Engineering Gears up for ‘Bionic’ Future” <i>The Medical Post</i> (1 April 1997) 39. ....	234
Kreidié, A., “Infant Foreskin Cells Help Heal Chronic Wounds” <i>The Medical Post</i> (16 December 1997) 46. ....	237
“Medical” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (11 April 1997) B6. ....	238
Gilmour, J., “‘Our’ Bodies? Property Rights in Human Tissue” (1993) 8 <i>Can. J. L. &amp; Society</i> 113. ....	239
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <i>Procurement and Transfer of Human Tissues and Organs</i> (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1992). ....	243
Note.....	247
Royal Commission on New Reproductive Technologies, <i>Proceed With Care</i> (Final Report), vol. 2 (Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1993) at 981-983. ....	248
American Fertility Society Update, “Fetal Tissue May Be New Oocyte Supply” <i>The Medical Post</i> (29 November 1994) 24. ....	253
“Male Fetus Eyed as Source for Ovarian Cancer Therapy” <i>The Medical Post</i> (28 October 1997). ....	254
“Birth of Donor Brother Questioned” <i>The Toronto Star</i> (4 October 2000) A3. ....	255
Note .....	256
“Ebay Stops Kidney Auctions” <i>USA TODAY</i> (3 September 1999). ....	257

## **XI. DRUGS AND DEVICES: LIABILITY AND REGULATION**

(i) **LIABILITY; REGULATION; INFORMED CONSENT**

Note..... 259

Health Protection Branch, Health and Welfare Canada,  
*Health Protection and Drug Laws* (Ottawa: Canada  
Communications Group, 1991) at 7, 25-29. .... 260

Lexchin, J., “Government Control and Regulation of Reproductive  
Drugs and Devices” (distributed by NAWL and DES Action). .... 264

Altman, L.K., “Fatal Drug Trial Raises Questions About ‘Informed Consent’”  
*New York Times* (5 October 1993) B7. .... 270

Note ..... 274

Miller, M., “Phase I Cancer Trials: A Collusion of Misunderstanding”  
(2000) 30:4 *Hastings Center Report* 34. .... 275

(ii) **TOO MUCH TOO SOON? BREAST IMPLANTS AND DES**

*Hollis v. Dow Corning Corp.*, [1995] 4 S.C.R. 634. .... 282

Note ..... 291

Acheson & Company Dow Corning Breast Implant Class Action, online:  
<<http://www.achesonco.com/biclass.htm>> (date accessed: 18 June 2001). .... 292

Note ..... 295

Papp, L., “Breast Implant Deal for 3,000”  
*The Toronto Star* (6 February 1998) A1. .... 296

Kolata, G., “Why, to Science, the Law's an Ass”  
*The Globe and Mail* (17 May 1995) A10. .... 298

“Implants a Textbook Case on How Public Can Rule Policy”  
*The Medical Post* (11 March 1997) 6. .... 299

“Implants Faulty, Jury Rules” *The Globe and Mail* (19 August 1997) A16. .... 299

(iii) **TOO LITTLE TOO LATE? AIDS PATIENTS AND ACCESS TO EXPERIMENTAL DRUGS**

Dixon, J., “Catastrophic Rights: Vital Public Interests and Civil Liberties in Conflict”  
in *Perspectives on AIDS* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1991) 122-136. .... 300

Treicher, P.A., “How to Have Theory in an Epidemic: The Evolution of AIDS Treatment Activism” in Penley, C., & Ross, A., eds., <i>Technoculture</i> (Minneapolis: U. Minn. Press, 1991) at 69-70, 76-78, 91-93. ....	312
Annas, G.J., “Faith (Healing), Hope, and Charity at the FDA: The Politics of AIDS Drug Trials”, in Gostin, L.O., ed., <i>AIDS and the Health Care System</i> (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990) 183-194. ....	315
Krueger, G., “AIDS Research Creates Ethical Issues” <i>The Medical Post</i> (5 July 1994) 64. ....	324
“Canada Criticized for Slow Approvals” <i>The Globe and Mail</i> (2 July 1998) A9. ....	325

## **XII. AIDS and HIV**

### **(i) DISCRIMINATION**

Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Part I of the <i>Constitution Act, 1982</i> , being Schedule B to the <i>Canada Act 1982</i> (U.K.), 1982, c. 11, ss. 1, 7, 8, 9, 12, 15. ....	326
<i>Ontario Human Rights Code</i> , R.S.O. 1990, c. H.19 (extracts). ....	327
Ontario Human Rights Commission, <i>Policy on HIV/AIDS-Related Discrimination</i> (27 November 1996) (extracts). ....	334
Note re <i>Thwaites v. Canada (Canadian Armed Forces)</i> ....	339

### **(a) Health Care Workers**

Canadian Medical Association, “HIV Infection in the Workplace” CMA Policy 2000, online: < <a href="http://www.cma.ca/staticContent/HTML/No/12/where_we_stand/hiv_in_the_workplace.pdf">http://www.cma.ca/staticContent/HTML/No/12/where_we_stand/hiv_in_the_workplace.pdf</a> > (last modified: 10 October 2002). ....	341
Fein, E., “Medical Workers with HIV Keep Silent, Fearing Reprisals” <i>New York Times</i> (21 December 1997) 41. ....	343
College of Physicians and Surgeons of Ontario, “Summary of Recommendations Directed at Regulatory Bodies from the Consensus Conference on Infected Health Care Workers: Risk for Transmission of Blood Borne Pathogens” <i>Members’ Dialogue</i> (May/June 1998) 15. ....	346
Note .....	347

**(b) Immigration**

“An Ethical Analysis of the Mandatory Exclusion of Immigrants Who Test HIV-Positive”(2000) 5:4 Can. HIV/AIDS Pol’y & L. Rev. .... 348

*Immigration and Refugee Protection Act*, S.C. 2001, c. 27 (extracts). .... 350

Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, Brief to the House of Commons Standing Committee on Citizenship and Immigration (4 May 2001). .... 352

Fitz-James, M., “Rules Create Lower Threshold for ‘Excessive Demand’” *Law Times* (11 November 2002) 11. .... 359

**(c) Women**

Overall, C., “AIDS and Women: The (Hetero)sexual Politics of HIV Infection” in Overall, C., & Zion, W., eds., *Perspectives on AIDS: Ethical and Social Issues* (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1991) 27-38 (extracts). .... 361

**(ii) USE OF CRIMINAL SANCTIONS**

Note re *R. v. Thornton* (1991), 1 O.R. (3d) 480 (C.A.), aff’d [1993] 2 S.C.R. 445. .... 367

*R. v. Cuerrier*, [1998] 2 S.C.R. 371. .... 368

Elliott, R., “After *Cuerrier*: Canadian Criminal Law and the Non-Disclosure of HIV-Positive Status” (Canadian HIV/AIDS Legal Network, 1999) (extracts). .... 383

Christie, T., “HIV Serostatus Disclosure: Legal, Scientific and Ethical Considerations” (2002) 22:3 Health L. Can. 70 (extracts). .... 389

Ainslie, D.C., “Questioning Bioethics: AIDS, Sexual Ethics, and the Duty to Warn” (1999) 29:5 Hastings Center Report 26 (extracts). .... 393

**These materials were prepared with the assistance of Alexandra Wilbee, Simon Thang, Brena Parnes, and Faith Holder (research),**

**and Felicia Holder (secretarial).**