

# **RESEARCH INVOLVING HUMANS: ETHICS, LAW AND REGULATION**

**PROFESSOR TRUDO LEMMENS**

**Faculty of Law**

**University of Toronto**

**FALL 2002**

(FOR INTERNAL USE BY STUDENTS)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### VOLUME I

#### I. Historical Overview and General Introduction

HK Beecher, "Ethics and Clinical Research," *New England Journal of Medicine* 1966 274: 1354-1360.

Jay Katz, "Experimentation Without Restriction," In: *Experimentation with Human Beings*. New York: Russell Sage, 1972: 283-292.

"Opening Statement of the Prosecution, December 9, 1946" and "Judgment and Aftermath". In: George Annas and Michael Grodin, eds., *The Nazi Doctors and the Nuremberg Code: Human Rights in Human Experimentation*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1992: 67-104.

Excerpts of the Nuremberg Trial. From: Jay Katz, *Experimentation with Human Beings*. New York: Russell Sage, 1972: 298-305.

Allan Brandt, "Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study," *Hastings Center Report* 1978 21-29.

Trudo Lemmens, "In the Name of National Security: Lessons From the Final Report on the Human Radiation Experiments," *European Journal of Health Law* 1999; 6: 7-23.

Kathleen C. Glass and Trudo Lemmens, "Research Involving Humans," In: Jocelyn Downie, et al., eds., *Canadian Health Law and Policy*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Markham, ON: Butterworths, 2002: 459-500.

#### II. Philosophical Reflections on Medical Research

John Abraham, "Bias in Science and Regulation," In: *Science, Politics and the Pharmaceutical Industry*. London: UCL Press, 1995: 1-35. (excerpts)

Guido Calabresi, "Reflections on Medical Experimentation in Humans," *Daedalus* 1969 98: 387-393

Hans Jonas, "Philosophical Reflections on Experimenting with Human Subjects," In: Paul Freund, ed., *Experimentation with Human Subjects*. New York: Braziller, 1970: 1-31.

U.S. National Commission for the Protection of Human Subjects of Biomedical and Behavioral Research. *The Belmont Report: Ethical Principles and Guidelines for the*

*Protection of Human Subjects of Research*. Washington DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, 1978.

### **III. The Changing Research Environment, and the Role of Research Ethics Boards**

Kurt Eichenwald and Gina Kolata, "Drug Trials Hide Conflicts for Doctors," *New York Times*. May 16, 1999.

Thomas Bodenheimer, "Uneasy Alliance – Clinician Investigators and the Pharmaceutical Industry," *New England Journal of Medicine* 2000 342 (20): 1539-1544

Marcia Angell, "Is Academic Medicine for Sale?" *New England Journal of Medicine* 2000 342(20): 1516-1518

Kathleen C. Glass and Trudo Lemmens, "Conflict of Interest and Commercialization of Biomedical Research: What is the Role of Research Ethics Review?" In: Timothy Caulfield and Bryn Williams-Jones, eds., *The Commercialization of Genetic Research: Ethical, Legal and Policy Issues*. New York: Plenum Press, 1999: 79-99.

J.A. Goldner, "Dealing with Conflicts of Interest in Biomedical Research: IRB Oversight as the Next Best Solution to the Abolition Approach," *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics*, 28 (2000): 379-404

Joel Lexchin, "Who Needs Faster Drug Approval Times in Canada: The Public or the Industry?" *International Journal of Health Services* 1994 24(2): 253-264.

Joel Lexchin, "Drug Makers and Drug Regulators: Too Close for Comfort. A Study of the Canadian Situation," *Social Sciences and Medicine* 1990 31: 1257-1263.

### **IV. Models of Research Regulation**

Simon Verdun-Jones and David Weisstub, "The Regulation of Biomedical Research Experimentation in Canada: Developing an Effective Apparatus for the Implementation of Ethical Principles in a Scientific Milieu," *Ottawa Law Review* 1996-97; 27: 297-341

Marie Hirtle, Trudo Lemmens, and Dominique Sprumont, "A comparative analysis of research ethics review mechanisms and the ICH Good Clinical Practice Guideline." *European Journal of Health Law* 1999 7: 5-31.

Trudo Lemmens and Benjamin Freedman, "Ethics Review for Sale? Conflict of Interest and Commercial Research Review Boards," *The Milbank Quarterly* 2000 78: 547-584.

Law Commission of Canada, *The Governance of Health Research Involving Human Subjects (HRIHS) – Executive Summary*. Ottawa: Law Commission of Canada, 2000.

U.S. National Bioethics Advisory Commission, "Summary – Protecting Research Participants: A Time for Change," In: *Ethical and Policy Issues in Research Involving Human Participants*. Bethesda, MD: National Bioethics Advisory Commission, 2001.

National Health Law and Family Law Sections, Canadian Bar Association, "Submission on Draft Legislation on Assisted Human Reproduction," *Health Law Review* 2002 10(2): 25-29.

## **VOLUME II**

### **V. The Content of REB Review: Value and Validity; Risk Assessment; Monitoring Research**

Ezekiel J. Emanuel, *et al.*, "What Makes Clinical Research Ethical?" *Journal of the American Medical Association* 2000 283(20): 2701-2711.

Benjamin Freedman, "Scientific Value and Validity as Ethical Requirements for Research: A Proposed Explication," *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1987 9(6): 7-10.

Charles Weijer, "The Ethical Analysis of Risk," *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 2000 28: 344-361.

Loretta M. Kopelman, "Moral Problems in Assessing Research Risk," *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 2000 22(5): 3-6.

Charles Weijer, *et al.*, "Monitoring Clinical Research: An Obligation Unfulfilled," *Canadian Medical Association Journal* 1995 152: 1973-1980.

### **VI. The Ethics of Clinical Trial Design**

Benjamin Freedman, "Equipoise and the Ethics of Clinical Research," *New England Journal of Medicine* 1987 317: 141-145.

Samuel Hellman and Deborah S. Hellman, "Of Mice but not Men: Problems of the Randomized Clinical Trial," *New England Journal of Medicine* 1991 324: 1585-1589.

Benjamin Freedman, *et al.*, "Placebo orthodoxy in clinical research I: empirical and methodological myths," and "Placebo orthodoxy in clinical research II: ethical, legal and regulatory myths," *Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics* 1996; 24: 243-259.

Franklin G. Miller and Howard Brody, "What Makes Placebo-Controlled Trials Unethical?" *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 3-9.

Robert M. Veatch, "Subject Indifference and the Justification of Placebo-Controlled Trials," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 12-13.

Trudo Lemmens and Paul B. Miller, "Avoiding a Jekyll-and-Hyde Approach to the Ethics of Clinical Research and Practice," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 14-17.

Nancy S. Jecker, "Exploiting Subjects in Placebo-Controlled Trials," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 19-20.

## **VII. Informed Consent and Challenges to Informed Consent**

Alan Donagan, "Informed Consent in Therapy and Experimentation," *Journal of Medicine and Philosophy* 1977; 2: 307-329.

John Moreno, "Captive and Convenient Populations," in Jeffrey Kahn *et al.*, eds., *Beyond Consent*. New York: Oxford University Press, 1998: 111-130.

Christine Grady, "Money for Research Participation: Does it Jeopardize Informed Consent?" *American Journal of Bioethics* 2001 1(2): 40-44.

Tod Chambers, "Participation as Commodity, Participation as Gift," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2001 1(2): 48.

Trudo Lemmens and Carl Elliott, "Justice for the Professional Guinea Pig," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2001 1(2): 51-53.

Nancy K. Reame, "Treating Research Subjects as Unskilled Wage Earners: A Risky Business," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2001 1(2): 53-54.

Laura Weiss Roberts, "The Ethical Basis of Psychiatric Research: Conceptual Issues and Empirical Findings," *Comprehensive Psychiatry* 1998 39: 99-110.

Carl Elliott, "Caring About Risks," *Archives of General Psychiatry* 1997 54: 113-116.

Louis Charland, "Cynthia's Dilemma: Consenting to Heroin Prescription," *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 37-47.

Carl Elliott, "Who Holds the Leash?" *American Journal of Bioethics* 2002 2(2): 48.

## **VIII. Selection of Subjects and Justice; Research Involving Communities**

Charles Weijer, "Evolving Ethical Issues in Selection of Subjects for Clinical Research," *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* 1996 5: 334-345.

Rebecca Dresser, "Wanted: Single, White Male for Medical Research," *Hastings Center Report* 1992 Jan-Feb: 24-29.

U.S. National Institutes of Health, *NIH Policy and Guidelines on the Inclusion of Children as Participants in Research Involving Human Subjects*. Bethesda, MD: NIH, 1998.

Paul B. Miller and Nuala P. Kenny, "Walking the Moral Tightrope: Respecting and Protecting Children in Health-Related Research," *Cambridge Quarterly of Healthcare Ethics* 2002 11: 217-229.

Charles Weijer and Ezekiel J. Emanuel, "Protecting Communities in Biomedical Research," *Science* 2000; 289: 1142-1144.

U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, Food and Drug Administration, *et al.*, "Guidance for Institutional Review Boards, Clinical Investigators and Sponsors: Exception from Informed Consent Requirements for Emergency Research – Draft Guidance," Rockville, MD, 30 March 2000.

Association of Canadian Universities for Northern Studies, *Ethical Principles for the Conduct of Research in the North*. Ottawa, ON: ACUNS, 1982, reprinted 1988.

Royal Commission on Aboriginal Peoples, Appendix B: *Ethical Guidelines for Research*. Ottawa, ON: RCAP, 1993.

Medical Research Council of Canada, Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council of Canada, Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, "Section 6 – Research Involving Aboriginal Peoples," In: *Tri-Council Policy Statement: Ethical Conduct for Research Involving Humans*. Ottawa, ON: Public Works and Government Services Canada, 1998: 6.1-6.4.

## **VOLUME III**

### **IX. Genetics and Research**

American Society of Human Genetics, "ASHG Report: Statement of Informed Consent for Genetic Research," *American Journal of Human Genetics* 1995 59: 471-474.

Kathleen C. Glass, *et al.*, "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part I: Gene Localization and Identification Studies." *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1996 18(4): 1-9.

Kathleen C. Glass, *et al.*, "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part II: Diagnostic and Screening Studies," *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1997 19(3-4): 1-13.

Kathleen C. Glass, *et al.*, "Structuring the Review of Human Genetics Protocols Part III: Gene Therapy Studies," *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1999 21: 1-9.

Mylene Deschenes, *et al.*, "Human Genetic Research, DNA Banking and Consent: A Question of 'Form'?" *Clinical Genetics* 2001 59: 221-239.

Laura M. Beskow, *et al.*, "Informed Consent for Population-Based Research Involving Genetics," *Journal of the American Medical Association* 2001 286(18): 2315-2321.

Jon F. Merz, "Is Genetics Research Minimal Risk?" *IRB: A Review of Human Subjects Research* 1996; 18, 6: 7-8.

Trudo Lemmens and Lisa Austin, "The Challenges of Regulating the Use of Genetic Information," *ISUMA: Canadian Journal of Policy Research* 2001 2(3): 26-37.

### **X. Justice and International Research**

George Annas and Michael Grodin, "Research Forum: Ethics and Studies of HIV; Human Rights and Maternal-Fetal HIV Transmission Prevention Trials in Africa," *American Journal of Public Health* 1998 88(4): 560-563.

Nicholas Christakis and Morris J. Panner, "Existing International Ethical Guidelines for Human Subjects Research: Some Open Questions," *Law, Medicine & Healthcare* 1991 19: 214-221.

Robert A. Crouch and John D. Arras, "AZT Trials and Tribulations," *Hastings Center Report* 1998 Nov-Dec: 26-34.

Carol Levine, "Placebos and HIV: Lessons Learned," *Hastings Center Report* 1998 Nov-Dec: 43-48.

## **XI. Legal Liability**

Helen Sava, *et al.*, "Legal Liability of Physicians in Medical Research," *Clinical Investigative Medicine* 1994 17: 148-184.

Marc A. Rodwin, "Strains in the Fiduciary Metaphor: Divided Physician Loyalties and Obligations in a Changing Health Care System," *American Journal of Law & Medicine* 1995 21: 241-257.

Paul E. Kalb and Kristin G. Koehler, "Legal Issues in Scientific Research," *Journal of the American Medical Association* 2002 287(1): 85-91.

Benjamin Freedman and Kathleen C. Glass, "Weiss v. Solomon: A Case Study in Institutional Responsibility for Clinical Research" *Law, Medicine & Healthcare* 1990 18: 395-403.

Ian Harvey and Ruth Chadwick, "Compensation for Harm: the Implications for Medical Research," *Social Sciences and Medicine* 1992 34: 1399-1404.

Wendy K. Mariner, "Compensation for Research Injuries," In; Anna C. Mastroianni, *et al.*, eds., *Women and Health Research: Ethical and Legal Issues of Including Women in Clinical Studies (Vol. 2)*, Washington, DC: National Academy Press, 1994: 113-126.

### **Addendum**

*Burton v. Brooklyn Doctors Hosp.* 452 N.Y.S. 2d 875 (App. Div. 1982)

*Halikas v. University of Minnesota* 856 F.Supp. 1331 (D.Minn 1994)

*Halushka v. University of Saskatchewan et al.* (1965) 52 W.W.R. 608

*Kus v. Sherman Hosp.* 664 N.E. 2d (Ill.App.2Dist. 1995)

*Moore v. Regents of the University of California* 793 P.2d 479 (Cal. 1990)

*Zimmer v. Ringrose* (1981) 4 W.W.R. 75

*Bailey v. Lally* 481 F.Supp. 203 (1979)

*Stewart v. Cleveland Clinic Foundation* 1999 WL 1068225 (Ohio App.8 Dist.)

*Norberg v. Wynrib* (1992), 92 D.L.R. (4<sup>th</sup>) 449 (SCC)